2

4 5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

26

2728

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, OAKLAND DIVISION

GRADY JACKSON and KELLEY ALEXANDER, in their representative capacity pursuant to Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17203, 17535 and Cal. Code Civ. Proc. §§ 382, 1021.5,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC., a Delaware Corporation, NIKKI HASKELL, an individual, GENERAL NUTRITION CORPORATION, a Pennsylvania Corporation, and VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES, INC., a New York Corporation, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO. C 08-05584-CW

JOINT APPLICATION TO AMEND ORDER SETTING FURTHER SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE TO ALLOW TELEPHONE APPEARANCES; [PROPOSED] ORDER

Date:

August 26, 2009

Time:

9:30 a.m.

Judge:

Hon. Joseph C. Spero

Location:

Courtroom A

Plaintiffs Grady Jackson and Kelley Alexander ("Plaintiffs") and Defendants Nikki Haskell, Balanced Health Products, Inc. ("BHP"), General Nutrition Corporation ("GNC"), and Vitamin Shoppe Industries Inc. ("Vitamin Shoppe") (collectively, the "Parties") hereby jointly apply to the Court for leave to amend the Notice and Order Setting Further Settlement Conference dated July 14, 2009, to allow certain appearances at the August 26 Settlement Conference by telephone and to continue the deadline for submitting updated Settlement Conference Statements by one week to August 19.

On April 1 and 2, the Parties participated in a Settlement Conference for which they submitted Settlement Conference Statements. The Parties have continued to exchange and discuss

proposals for resolving the case, but believe a second settlement conference may be required to bridge the gaps. But in light of the October 30, 2009 deadline to complete non-expert class certification discovery, the sooner a settlement conference can be held the more likely it is to succeed. The earliest the Parties can reconvene is August 26, but only if certain appearances are by phone.

David Gernsbacher, counsel for Defendants Haskell and BHP, expects to be engaged in trial in another case beginning the week of August 10, 2009, through the end of the week of August 21st. Accordingly, the earliest available date for a settlement conference would be during the week of August 24th. The parties are concerned that delaying the settlement conference beyond the week of August 24th would undermine the likelihood of settlement, in light of the need for the Parties to commence non-expert class certification discovery.

Mr. Gernsbacher can appear at a settlement conference on August 26th by telephone, but an unavoidable, out-of-town obligation related to a family illness will prevent him from attending a settlement conference in person that week or on any date before September 10, when Ms. Haskell's motion to dismiss the Second Amended Complaint is scheduled to be heard. The Parties agree that having Mr. Gernsbacher appear at a settlement conference on August 26th by telephone is more likely to result in settlement than delaying the conference to a later date on which he might be able to attend in person and therefore respectfully apply to the Court for approval for Mr. Gernsbacher to appear telephonically.

In addition, Plaintiff Jackson will start training camp with the Detroit Lions in Allen Park, Michigan, on July 1 and will be unable to travel to San Francisco in August. All of the other parties or their authorized representatives would have to travel to attend the settlement conference – Plaintiff Alexander and Defendants Haskell and BHP from Los Angeles, Defendant GNC from Pennsylvania and Defendant Vitamin Shoppe from New Jersey – and the Parties would prefer to avoid travel costs and instead put those resources toward a potential resolution. Mr. Gernsbacher is also reluctant to have his clients appear in person without him. Each of the parties or party representatives would, however, be available to attend the settlement conference on August 26th by telephone.

. 8

For these reasons, the Parties believe that having these party representatives appear at a settlement conference on August 26th by telephone is more likely to result in settlement than delaying the conference to a later date, and respectfully request that the Court authorize the party representatives as well as Mr. Gernsbacher to appear telephonically. Otherwise, the further settlement conference currently scheduled for August 26 will have to be continued, but, in light of the pending class certification and motion deadlines, it is not clear whether or when a continued settlement conference could be convened before the further ADR session currently scheduled for next February in the Case Management Order.

In the event that the Court declines to grant Mr. Gernsbacher or the party representatives leave to appear at the August 26th settlement conference by telephone, the Parties respectfully request that the August 26th settlement conference be removed from the Court's calendar, as the agreement of Ms. Haskell and BHP to participate in an August 26th settlement conference was expressly conditioned on Mr. Gernsbacher's ability to appear by telephone.

Finally, it is possible the Parties will continue to discuss the terms of a potential resolution prior to the next settlement conference and believe it would be helpful to include a description of those discussions in the updated settlement conference statements to be submitted with the Court. In light of summer vacation schedules and other case schedules, it would be helpful in this regard if the deadline for submitting the updated settlement conference statements could be moved back one week, from August 12 (or two weeks before the next settlement conference) to August 19. The Parties believe this would not unduly burden the Court since Settlement Conference Statements were submitted prior to the April 1-2 Settlement Conference and the Court is aware of the primary issues in the case and with respect to settlement.

Accordingly, it is HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between the Parties, through their respective counsel, as follows:

1. In light of the October 30, 2009, deadline to complete non-expert class certification discovery in this case, a settlement conference should be held as soon as possible in order for settlement conference discussions to be meaningful and for the Parties to have a reasonably good chance of settling the case through the conference;

510-482-4971

510-482-4971

p.1

1	2. Having Mr. Gernsbacher and the par	rty representatives appear at a settlement			
2	conference on August 26th by telephone is more likely to result in settlement than delaying the				
3	conference to a later date;				
4	3. Because the Parties may not agree to a settlement conference after the week of				
5	August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settlement conference with telephone appearances by				
6	Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avoid the				
7	waste of judicial resources; and				
8	4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution prior				
9	to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to move				
10	the deadline for submitting those updates from Aug	gust 12 to August 19, 2009.			
11	PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP	FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS			
12	By: And Duranet	By:			
13	Andrew A. August	Eric J. Farber			
14	Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY	Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY			
15	ALEXANDER	ALEXANDER			
16	LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER	MCGUIRE WOODS LLP			
17	By:	By:			
18	David Gernsbacher	Sidney K. Kanazawa			
19	Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC.	Attorneys for Defendants GENERAL NUTRITION			
20	and NIKKI HASKELL	CORPORATION and GENERAL			
21	HOLDE BODEDEC & ONESLLED	NUTRITION CENTERS, INC.			
22	HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP				
23	By:Roger R. Myers				
24	Adam Brezine				
25	Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.				
26					
27					
28					
- 1	1				

1	2. Having Mr. Gernsbacher and the part	ty representatives appear at a settlement				
2	conference on August 26th by telephone is more likely to result in settlement than delaying the					
3	conference to a later date;					
4	3. Because the Parties may not agree to	a settlement conference after the week of				
5	August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settlement conference with telephone appearances by					
6	Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avoid the					
7	waste of judicial resources; and					
8	4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution prior					
9	to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to move					
10	the deadline for submitting those updates from Aug	ust 12 to August 19, 2009.				
11	PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP	FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS				
112 113 114 115 116 117 118 119 120 221 222 223 224 225 226	By:	Eric J. Farber Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  MCGUIRE WOODS LLP  By: Sidney K. Kanazawa Attorneys for Defendants GENERAL NUTRITION CORPORATION and GENERAL NUTRITION CENTERS, INC.				
28						
[ ]						

conference to a later date;  3. Because the Parties may not agree to a settlement conference after the week of August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settlement conference with telephone appearan Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avo waste of judicial resources; and  4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorneys for Defendants By:  David Gernsbacher Attorneys for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC.  GENERAL NUTRITION	1	2.	Having Mr. Gernsbacher and the part	ty repr	resentatives appear at a settlement		
3. Because the Parties may not agree to a settlement conference after the week of August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settlement conference with telephone appearan Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avo waste of judicial resources; and 4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER By:  David Gernsbacher Attorneys for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	2	conference on August 26th by telephone is more likely to result in settlement than delaying the					
August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settlement conference with telephone appearan Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avo waste of judicial resources; and  4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  By:  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants GENER AL NUTRITION CORPORATION and GENERAL NUTRITION CENTERS, INC.  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	3	conference to	a later date;				
Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avo waste of judicial resources; and  4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS By:  Andrew A. August Eric J. Farber Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	4	3.	Because the Parties may not agree to	a settl	lement conference after the week of		
4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	5	August 24th,	proceeding with the August 26th settle	ement	conference with telephone appearances by		
4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	6	Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avoid the					
to submitting the updated confidential settlement conference statements, it would be helpful to the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorneys for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	7	waste of judi	cial resources; and				
the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.  PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	8	4.	To provide the Parties additional time	e to di	scuss potential terms of a resolution prior		
PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP  By:  Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	9	to submitting	the updated confidential settlement co	nferen	ce statements, it would be helpful to move		
By: By: By: By: By: By: Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER By:	10	the deadline for submitting those updates from August 12 to August 19, 2009.					
By: Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER By: David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL  HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By: Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	11	PINNACLE	LAW GROUP, LLP	FAR	BER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS		
HOLME, ROBERTS & OWEN LLP  By:  Roger R. Myers Adam Brezine Attorneys for Defendant VITAMIN SHOPPE INDUSTRIES INC.	13   14   15   16   17   18   19   20	Andrew Attorney GRADY ALEXA  LAW OFFIC  By: David Attorney BALA	ys for Plaintiffs Y JACKSON and KELLY NDER ES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER Gernsbacher ey for Defendants NCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC.	мсс	Eric J. Farber Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  GUIRE WOODS LLP  Sidney K. Kanazawa Attorneys for Defendants GENERAL NUTRITION CORPORATION and GENERAL		
	22 23 24 25 26 27	By: Roger   Adam   Attorne	R. Myers Brezine eys for Defendant				

2. Having Mr. Gernsbacher and the par	ty representatives appear at a settlement			
conference on August 26th by telephone is more likely to result in settlement than delaying the				
conference to a later date;				
3. Because the Parties may not agree to a settlement conference after the week of				
August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settlement conference with telephone appearances by				
Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in the interest of justice and necessary to avoid the				
waste of judicial resources; and				
4. To provide the Parties additional time to discuss potential terms of a resolution prior				
to submitting the updated confidential settlement co	onference statements, it would be helpful to move			
the deadline for submitting those updates from Aug	ust 12 to August 19, 2009.			
PINNACLE LAW GROUP, LLP	FARBER & COMPANY ATTORNEYS			
By: Andrew A. August Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By: David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC. and NIKKI HASKELL	By:  Eric J. Farber Attorneys for Plaintiffs GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  MCGUIRE WOODS LLP  By:  Sidney K. Kanazawa Attorneys for Defendants GENERAL NUTRITION CORPORATION and GENERAL NUTRITION CENTERS, INC.			
HOLME, ROBERTS & WEN LLP				
	conference to a later date;  3. Because the Parties may not agree to August 24th, proceeding with the August 26th settle Mr. Gernsbacher and the party representatives is in waste of judicial resources; and  4. To provide the Parties additional time to submitting the updated confidential settlement continued the deadline for submitting those updates from August Attorneys for Plaintiffs  GRADY JACKSON and KELLY ALEXANDER  LAW OFFICES OF DAVID GERNSBACHER  By:  David Gernsbacher Attorney for Defendants BALANCED HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC.			

Having reviewed the Parties' joint application and stipulation and good cause shown, the Court hereby GRANTS the Parties' request to amend the Notice and Order Setting Further Settlement Conference to authorize the party representatives and David Gernsbacher, counsel for Defendants Balanced Health Products, Inc and Nikki Haskell, to appear at the August 26th settlement conference by telephone.

Dated: 7/31/09